

## Norco College General Education Assessment Report: 2013-2014<sup>1</sup>

### Background

The three colleges in the Riverside Community College District—Riverside City College, Moreno Valley College, and Norco College—maintain a shared curriculum and a common General Education program. The District initially developed learning outcomes for its GE program in 2006. Between 2011 and 2013, a workgroup appointed by the District academic senate, consisting of representatives from all three colleges, undertook a thorough review of the GE program and its outcomes, eventually recommending substantial changes in the outcomes, which were adopted district-wide in spring 2013. The 2006 GE outcomes had consisted of 25 sub-outcomes in six different domains. The workgroup determined that there was overlap and duplication among some of the outcomes and that some were effectively unassessable. It agreed that a simpler and less cumbersome list of outcomes was possible and desirable, and that such a list could be made consistent with ACCJC standards regarding General Education. As of spring, 2013, then, Norco College has four main learning outcomes for its GE program: critical thinking, information competency and technological literacy, communication, and self-development and global awareness. The College conceives of its GE outcomes and institutional outcomes as one and the same. It also sees assessment of its GE program as a good proxy for assessing the CSU GE and IGETC programs.

The College has annually assessed its GE outcomes indirectly by means of a learning gains survey administered to graduates either on the day of graduation or (more recently) online, when students apply to graduate. It has also undertaken several projects to assess critical thinking, written communication skills, and information competency over the last five years. In spring 2013, the Norco Assessment Committee (NAC) decided that the College would systematize its assessment of GE by focusing each year on a single GE outcome, beginning in fall 2013 with “Self-Development & Global Awareness.” The outcome reads, *“Students will be able to develop goals and devise strategies for personal development and well-being. They will be able to demonstrate an understanding of what it means to be an ethical human being and effective citizen in their awareness of diversity and various cultural viewpoints.”* As the name suggests, this outcome combines two related but distinct sub-outcomes, one involving personal growth and well-being, the other involving awareness and appreciation of diversity as a foundation to effective global citizenship. NAC determined that the two sub-outcomes should be assessed separately.

### Methodology

The college has developed an approach to program-level assessment that involves identifying “quasi-capstone” courses for simultaneous course and program assessment. For the fall 2013 GE assessment project, NAC recruited faculty from five large-enrollment courses in which at least one course SLO mapped clearly to at least a portion of the GE outcome involving self-development and global

---

<sup>1</sup> This report was prepared by Arend Flick, Norco College assessment coordinator, with the assistance of Greg Aycock, Dean of Institutional Effectiveness; Monica Green, Vice President of Student Services; Damon Nance, Dean of Technology and Learning Resources; and Dimitrios Synodinos, Student Activities Coordinator.

awareness. Three of the five classes (English 1B, Sociology 1, and Psychology 9) had explicit diversity outcomes among the course SLOs; two of the five (Health Science 1 and Guidance 48) had explicit self-development outcomes among the course SLOs. The three courses chosen to assess diversity are already GE courses that enroll hundreds of students—almost no student graduates from Norco College without taking at least one of them. The two courses chosen to assess self-development are not, as yet, part of the GE program, but they are frequently taken by students, usually as part of the section VII “Additional Degree Requirements,” and there has been some talk about formally folding these requirements into GE. The college offered 38 sections of these five courses (11 of ENG-1B, six of PSY-9, eight of SOC-1, nine of HES-1, and six of PSY-9). Over 80% of the instructors of these classes participated in the project.

Three sets of data were collected:

1. Instructors were asked to evaluate each of their students according to how well a late-term assignment enabled students to demonstrate competency in the specific outcome being assessed for that course. Using a Scantron with student names and ID numbers, instructors bubbled in a score for each student ranging from 4 (clear evidence that the outcome had been achieved) to 1 (little or no evidence the outcome had been achieved). The number of completed GE units was identified for each student and students were assigned to categories (Less than 12 units, 12-24 units, greater than 24 units). Mean scores were derived by course and GE SLO, and differences between categories of GE units completed were analyzed for statistical significance. In addition cross tabulations disaggregating ethnicity by GE scores (1 to 4) were provided to identify if there was any disproportionate performance of subgroups.
2. Instructors were also asked to complete a Survey Monkey questionnaire regarding their teaching of diversity or personal self-development in the course, with open-ended questions asking instructors to provide specific examples of teaching decisions and techniques relevant to the outcome.
3. Students were surveyed anonymously at the end of the class about the extent to which they believed they achieved the specific SLO, the extent to which they thought their course contributed to their achievement of the GE outcome involving diversity or self-development, the extent to which they thought the college (apart from the course) has helped to foster achievement of the GE outcome, and the extent to which they would be likely to recommend the course to other students.

Data from these surveys and assessments are summarized and analyzed below.

In addition to the collection of data from individual Norco College classes, this project also incorporates qualitative evidence of GE SLO achievement based on student exposure to diversity and personal development issues through workshops, presentations, and activities under the auspices of student services, student activities, etc. That evidence is summarized in appendices 1 and 2 below.

## Results

### Data Set 1

Results from the faculty evaluation of student work are as follows:

**English 1B:** “Students will be able to read diverse literary works from a variety of genres as well as from diverse authorial voices and cultural contexts with understanding and insight.” Average score = 2.95<sup>2</sup>

**Psychology 9:** “Students will be able to identify important social factors and cultural differences in developmentally relevant processes such as attachment cycles, parenting styles, marriage and intimacy, and attitudes toward aging.” Mean score = 3.02

**Sociology 1:** Students will be able to “demonstrate a knowledge of the key concepts and principles in the following areas of specialty within sociology: culture, socialization, large organizations, crime and deviance, marriage and family relations, race and ethnic relations.” Mean score = 2.90

**Guidance 48:** Students will be able to “demonstrate an understanding of the principles necessary for a healthy adjustment to the social environment.” Mean score = 3.55

**Health Sciences 1:** “Students will be able to evaluate the impact of psychoactive drugs, alcohol, and tobacco on physiological and psychological aspects of personal health and society interaction.” Mean score = 3.13

Scores of individual students were analyzed in terms of how many GE units the students had previously completed and then sorted into three groups. Group 1 consists of students who had completed fewer than 12 units; group 2 consisted of students who had completed 12 – 24 units; and group 3 consisted of students who had completed 25 or more units. Mean scores for each group are as follows:

	Global Awareness GE SLO		Self-Development GE SLO	
	N	Mean	N	Mean
Group 1 < 12 units	108	2.69	208	3.05
Group 2 12-24 units	118	3.14	156	3.26
Group 3 more than 24 units	373	3.01	208	3.31
Total	599	2.98	572	3.20

For Global Awareness, differences between groups 1 and 3 and between groups 1 and 2 are significant ( $p < .05$ ). For Self-Development, difference between groups 1 and 3 is significant ( $p < .05$ ).

The following tables give an overview of demographic data related to the diversity/global awareness outcome and the personal development outcome.

---

<sup>2</sup> One honors section of English 1B was assessed, with an average score of 3.33

### Ethnicity Level Crosstabulation: Global Awareness

		Score				Total
		1	2	3	4	
Ethnicity	Count	1	1	0	0	2
	% within Ethnicity	50.0%	50.0%	0.0%	0.0%	100.0%
African-American	Count	2	5	7	9	23
	% within Ethnicity	8.7%	21.7%	30.4%	39.1%	100.0%
Asian/Pac Is	Count	2	16	27	21	66
	% within Ethnicity	3.0%	24.2%	40.9%	31.8%	100.0%
Hispanic	Count	31	72	99	96	298
	% within Ethnicity	10.4%	24.2%	33.2%	32.2%	100.0%
Native American	Count	0	0	1	1	2
	% within Ethnicity	0.0%	0.0%	50.0%	50.0%	100.0%
Two or more races	Count	3	3	6	11	23
	% within Ethnicity	13.0%	13.0%	26.1%	47.8%	100.0%
Unknown/Nonrespondent	Count	0	3	4	5	12
	% within Ethnicity	0.0%	25.0%	33.3%	41.7%	100.0%
White	Count	9	33	63	70	175
	% within Ethnicity	5.1%	18.9%	36.0%	40.0%	100.0%
Total	Count	48	133	207	213	601
	% within Ethnicity	8.0%	22.1%	34.4%	35.4%	100.0%

### Ethnicity Level Crosstabulation: Self-Development

		Score				Total
		1	2	3	4	
Ethnicity	Count	0	1	0	0	1
	% within Ethnicity	0.0%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	100.0%
African-American	Count	2	10	5	13	30
	% within Ethnicity	6.7%	33.3%	16.7%	43.3%	100.0%
Asian/Pac Is	Count	4	9	15	14	42
	% within Ethnicity	9.5%	21.4%	35.7%	33.3%	100.0%
Hispanic	Count	26	44	108	167	345
	% within	7.5%	12.8%	31.3%	48.4%	100.0%

	Ethnicity					
Native American	Count	0	0	0	1	1
	% within Ethnicity	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	100.0%	100.0%
Two or more races	Count	2	2	8	13	25
	% within Ethnicity	8.0%	8.0%	32.0%	52.0%	100.0%
Unknown/Nonrespondent	Count	1	0	4	3	8
	% within Ethnicity	12.5%	0.0%	50.0%	37.5%	100.0%
White	Count	3	17	37	65	122
	% within Ethnicity	2.5%	13.9%	30.3%	53.3%	100.0%
Total	Count	38	83	177	276	574
	% within Ethnicity	6.6%	14.5%	30.8%	48.1%	100.0%

## Data Set 2

A total of 27 instructors of courses with SLOs that map to the global awareness GE SLO responded to the survey, some from relevant disciplines that were not a formal part of this study. They included six instructors from Psychology 1, four from English 1B, three from Psychology 1, nine from assorted courses (English 1A in particular), and several from Art 6 and Music 19. Only one instructor from Sociology 1 completed the survey. Responses were as follows:

1. Thirteen of the 27 said they place “great emphasis” on making students aware of diversity when they teach the class. Another 13 said they place “some emphasis.” One said s/he places “little emphasis.”
2. Thirteen of the 27 said they place “great emphasis” on making students aware of various cultural viewpoints. Fourteen said they place “some emphasis.”
3. Instructors were asked which areas of diversity and cultural viewpoints they “actively teach.” Twenty-five said they actively teach gender issues, 22 teach race, 20 teach economic status, 18 teach ethnicity, 16 teach sexuality, 12 teach age, 11 teach disability, 11 teach political viewpoints, and 11 teach geographical diversity.
4. Four instructors indicated that more than 75% of their class is devoted to issues related to diversity or various cultural viewpoints. Eleven said that 50-75% of their class is. Nine said 25-50% is. Three said less than 25% of their class is.
5. Two instructors said that more than 75% of their assignments test students’ ability to demonstrate awareness of diversity and/or various cultural viewpoints. Eight said 50-75% do. Thirteen said 25-50% do. Four said less than 25% do.
6. Twenty-four instructors said that it is “very important” to them that students with diverse identities, backgrounds, or beliefs feel comfortable in their classes. Three said it was “important.”

7. Twenty three instructors said that they “definitely” believe higher education (and specifically the Norco College GE program) has a role to play in ensuring students become more aware of diversity and various cultural viewpoints. Four said that it “probably” does.
8. The next question asked instructors to cite some specific ways or examples of how they teach diversity. Please see Appendix 3 for these responses.
9. The next question asked instructors to indicate what they strive for in teaching diversity besides “awareness” of it. Many instructors used words like “appreciation,” “understanding,” and “acceptance” to answer this question. See Appendix 3 for these responses.
10. The final question asked instructors what more the college or their discipline could do to improve the teaching of diversity and various cultural viewpoints. The 19 responses may be found in Appendix 3.

Three instructors of courses that map to the self-development GE SLO completed the survey, one from Guidance 48 and two from Health Science 1. Responses were as follows:

1. Two indicated that they place “great emphasis” on helping students develop goals for their personal development and well-being. One indicated that s/he places “some emphasis” on it.
2. Instructors were asked to provide an example of the kinds of goals for personal development they would like to see their students develop. Responses included “research and compile a personal family history of illness to establish the students’ risk factors for various diseases,” “develop a stronger sense of their learning styles, stress and relaxation methods and time management skills,” develop an “understanding of how to modify or change their unhealthy behaviors which incorporates a systematic progression discussed in class. An understanding of the relationship between their lifestyle choices and the consequences on their health.”
3. One instructor indicated that s/he places “great emphasis” on helping students devise strategies for realizing their goals for personal development or well-being. Two indicated that they place “some emphasis” on it.
4. Instructors were asked to provide an example of the kinds of strategies they would like to see students devise in the course for their personal development or well-being. Responses included “create a personal diet and exercise plan that is thorough and realistic,” “develop a lifestyle plan which would improve the likelihood of enhancing their overall health,” and “develop strategies to assist them with their personal development and well-being.”
5. One instructor indicated that s/he focuses more than 75% of the class on helping students develop goals or devise strategies for personal development and/or well-being. Two indicated that the devote 50-75% of class to this outcome.
6. One instructor indicated that more than 75% of assignments test students’ abilities to develop goals and devise strategies for personal development and well-being. One instructor indicated that 50-25% of assignments did that. One instructor indicated that less than 25% of assignments did that.
7. All three instructors indicated that they “definitely” believe higher education (specifically the Norco College general education program) has a role to play in ensuring that students are able to develop goals and devise strategies for personal development and well-being.

8. The next question asked instructors to cite some examples of how they teach students to develop goals and/or devise strategies for personal development and well-being. See Appendix 3 for responses.
9. Instructors were asked what they think the college or their discipline could do to improve the teaching of self-development and well-being skills. They responded by saying, “decrease class sizes,” “offer more sections of HES-1 so that cap size could be reduced,” and collaborate across the college on successful teaching methods and resources in teaching this outcome.

### Data Set 3

During fall, 2013, students in the five courses participating in the GE assessment project were surveyed at the end of the semester about their perception of their own learning gains in the course. Surveys were completed by 1240 students in 34 sections of these classes. The first question asked students to assess the extent to which they thought they achieved a specific SLO for the course related to diversity and/or personal self-development. (English 1B, Psychology 9, and Sociology 1 students were assessed for diversity; students in Health 1 and Guidance 48 were assessed for goal setting and personal development.) The second question asked students to what extent the class itself helped them either to become aware of diversity and various cultural viewpoints OR to develop goals and devise strategies for personal development and well-being. The third question asked students to what extent their other coursework and experiences at Norco College has helped to make them aware of diversity and other various cultural viewpoints OR to develop goals and devise strategies for personal development and well-being. The fourth question asked students how likely they were to recommend the course to friends or acquaintances. All questions employed a five-point scale, with A = greatly, B = moderately, C = slightly, D = not at all, and E = unable to judge. The following table provides the results of the survey:

	A	B	C	D	E
<b>Question 1</b>					
ENG-1B (N = 292)	73%	23%	3%	1%	0%
PSY-9 (N = 210)	68%	24%	8%	0%	0%
SOC-1 (N = 222)	42%	46%	9%	1%	1%
HES-1 (N = 404)	59%	31%	8%	1%	1%
GUI-48 (N = 112)	53%	36%	9%	1%	1%
Mean score	60%	31%	7%	1%	1%
<b>Question 2</b>					
ENG-1B	48%	40%	8%	3%	1%
PSY-9	44%	39%	10%	6%	1%
SOC-1	53%	36%	9%	1%	1%
HES-1	47%	35%	14%	4%	1%
GUI-48	62%	25%	9%	3%	0%
Average score	49%	36%	11%	3%	1%
<b>Question 3</b>					
ENG-1B	39%	40%	17%	2%	2%
PSY-9	32%	40%	19%	3%	5%
SOC-1	28%	47%	18%	4%	3%
HES-1	37%	43%	14%	4%	2%
GUI-48	49%	39%	8%	2%	0%

Average score	36%	42%	16%	3%	3%
<b>Question 4</b>					
ENG-1B	71%	25%	3%	1%	0%
PSY-9	62%	18%	13%	6%	1%
SOC-1	45%	38%	11%	5%	1%
HES-1	64%	23%	9%	3%	0%
GUI-48	62%	21%	9%	7%	0%
Average score	62%	25%	9%	4%	N/A

For comparison purposes, here are the average scores over the past five years to similar questions posed to Norco College graduates about the extent to which they believed they achieved learning gains in areas relevant to this study. The survey used a three-point scale, with 3 indicating “significant gains” in this area, 2 indicating “moderate gains,” 1 indicating “little gains,” and zero indicating no gains. (Paper surveys were administered on the day of graduation from 2009 – 2012; beginning in 2013, online surveys were administered when students applied for graduation. Scores slipped in virtually all categories from 2012 to 2013 by an average of .13, perhaps as a result.)

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	5-year ave
<b>Q20: Setting Goals / devising strategies for personal and professional development and well being.</b>	<b>2.59</b>	<b>2.74</b>	<b>2.68</b>	<b>2.74</b>	<b>2.59</b>	<b>2.67</b>
<b>Q24: Demonstrating understanding of ethnic, religious, and socioeconomic diversity.</b>	<b>2.49</b>	<b>2.62</b>	<b>2.61</b>	<b>2.64</b>	<b>2.54</b>	<b>2.58</b>
<b>Q25: Demonstrating understanding of alternative political, historical, and cultural viewpoints</b>	<b>2.48</b>	<b>2.57</b>	<b>2.57</b>	<b>2.65</b>	<b>2.53</b>	<b>2.56</b>

### Other Data

Although not a formal part of this GE study, recent Accreditation and CCSSE surveys administered by Norco College contain questions relevant to the assessment of these outcomes. In the 2013 Accreditation Survey, 130 respondents (comprising faculty, administrators, and staff) were asked if the college’s “policies and practices demonstrate appropriate concern for issues of equity and diversity. One hundred and nine of the 130 (83.8%) said they “somewhat” or “strongly” agreed with this statement, with another 15 having no opinion.

In the 2013 CCSSE survey, the following questions address areas relevant to the Global Awareness and Self-Development GE SLO:



1. Students were asked if they “had serious conversations with students of a different race or ethnicity other than your own.” Responses: never = 203; sometimes = 259; often = 240; very often = 248. Percent often /very often = 51.4% **(better than 2013 CCSSE cohort)**
2. Students were asked if they “had serous conversations with students who differ from you in terms of their religious beliefs, political opinions, or personal values.” Responses: never = 230; sometimes = 306; often = 215; very often = 199. Percent often/very often = 43.6% **(better than 2013 CCSSE cohort)**
3. Students were asked how much does Norco College emphasize “encouraging contact among students from different economic, social, and racial or ethnic backgrounds.” Responses: very little = 166; some = 243; quite a bit = 298; very much = 223. Percent quite a bit / very much = 56% **(better than 2013 CCSSE cohort)**
4. Students were asked how much their experience at Norco College contributed to their knowledge, skills, and personal development in “understanding people of other racial and ethnic backgrounds.” Responses: very little = 213; some = 270; quite a bit = 243; very much = 209. Percent quite a bit / very much = 48.3 % **(better than 2013 CCSSE cohort)**
5. Students were asked how much their experience at Norco College contributed to their knowledge, skills, and personal development in “developing clearer career goals.” Responses: very little = 171; some = 253; quite a bit = 284; very much = 191. Percent quite a bit / very much = 52.8%

## Conclusions

### Course Assessment

Employing a common rubric but examining different (though related) SLOs and different artifacts, instructors in the five courses examined as part of this project saw, on average, their students as providing adequate to slightly better than adequate evidence that the course SLO had been achieved. Average scores ranged from 3.55 for GUI-48 to 2.90 for SOC-1, with only one other course (ENG-1B) averaging 2.95. Since ENG-1B and SOC-1 were considerably lower than those for the other three classes, it would make sense to look more closely (perhaps by surveying instructors) at why this is. Students surveys were, in general, more positive about the extent to which students believed they achieved the course SLO than instructor scores would seem to indicate. Of the 292 ENG-1B students surveyed, 73% were very confident the course had helped them achieve the SLO related to diversity and another 23% were moderately confident. Only two courses—SOC-1, in which 88% of students were definitely or moderately confident the course had helped them achieve the SLO; and GUI-48, in which 89% of students were definitely or moderately confident—had scores less than 90%. A mild cause for concern is that fewer than half of the SOC-1 students were very confident they had achieved the SLO. Since instructor surveys for the three diversity courses (ENG-1B, SOC-1, and PSY-9) all indicated that teachers believe they are emphasizing diversity in classroom assignments and discussion, it may be that students are simply not always sufficiently aware that a particular issue under consideration is diversity-related. Gender issues in particular (which instructors indicate they emphasize more than any other topic related to diversity) may simply need to be labeled more explicitly as diversity-related.

A great majority of student (87%) would recommend the course to other students, with a high of 96% of ENG-1B students and a low of 80% of PSY-1 students. However, 62% of PSY-1 students would definitely recommend the course, while only 45% of SOC-1 students would.

### GE Assessment

Instructor scores on the diversity sub-outcome and the self-development sub-outcome correlated, for the most part, with number of units of GE the student had completed, thereby providing some evidence that the program as a whole contributes to student achievement of this outcome. A somewhat puzzling feature of these data (which were also present for many of the Area of Emphasis assessment data of a year ago) in the diversity category is that students who completed more than 24 units in the GE program did less well (though not to a statistically significant extent) than students who had completed 12-24 units. Similarly, the great majority of students (85%) said in their survey responses that the course had helped them achieve the GE SLO; 78% said that their other coursework at the college had also contributed. (A somewhat odd feature of the student response data is that significantly more students believe they had achieved the course SLO but NOT the GE SLO by virtue of their enrollment in the class.) Of the more than 1200 students surveyed, 36% were very confident their other coursework helped them achieve the GE SLO and another 42% were somewhat confident. These are good—but not entirely reassuring—numbers, suggesting perhaps the need for some modification of the GE program itself to ensure that all students take a course more explicitly labeled “global awareness” (and perhaps “self-development”).

Demographic data suggest that, according to instructor evaluations, 76% of White students are demonstrating achievement of the diversity GE SLO, 72.8% of Asian-Americans, 69.5% of African-Americans, and 65.4% of Hispanics. With the self-development GE SLO, the spread between the highest and lowest performing group is much more significant: Whites, 83.6%; Hispanics, 79.6%; Asian-Americans, 69%, and African-Americans, 69%. We need to investigate what is happening in our GUI-48 and HES-1 classes that might be contributing to this discrepancy.

### Recommendations

- Improvement in student achievement of GE outcomes is going to be difficult to achieve without considering changes in the program itself. But efforts to modify the program (as well as other RCCD programs, like the AOE's) have stalled because of the need to coordinate efforts across the three colleges. It is time to consider the feasibility and desirability of enabling the colleges to share a curriculum but develop their own GE programs, and GE SLOs, as they already do with their ADTs. The combination of diversity/global awareness with personal self-development is unwieldy, and *there is no compelling evidence that students are meeting the self-development outcome as part of the present GE program*. Assuming self-development is kept as part of the list of GE outcomes, we will want to consider adding a requirement that students choose from a list of newly added (or modified) GE courses to enable that outcome to be met. It must be noted, however, that HES-1 and GUI-48 instructors did not, as a whole, demonstrate their interest in this potential modification through their active participation in this assessment

project. Only three of the ten instructors completed the survey we asked them, multiple times, to complete.

- The fall 2013 GE assessment project generally worked, producing usable data that enabled us to draw meaningful conclusions about the degree to which students in the GE program achieve this particular outcome. We recommend that another one of the GE outcomes be selected for assessment in fall 2014, with data collected in that term and analyzed in spring 2015. A logical choice would be the “Information and Technological Competency” outcome, which has never been systematically assessed at Norco College. The same procedure employed in fall 2013 could be used again, with minor modifications. Assuming TracDat is operative, we would not need to ask instructors to complete Scantron forms, which would be a great advantage. But it might also be possible to standardize the assessment in ways we didn’t attempt to do in 2013. Either a common and more precise rubric could be employed by which instructors in selected courses assess this competency, or perhaps even a common assignment of some sort might be developed. (This, conceivably, is an outcome that might lend itself to the development of an objective measurement instrument.) In any event, we need to begin planning now for the fall 2014 assessment project.
- With data on one outcome collected in 2014, it may make sense to declare 2014-15 the year of “global awareness and self-development” at Norco College, so we can work more systematically on an outcome many of students seem to believe they are not achieving through their work at the college. (A sentiment with which their instructors seem to agree.) One common refrain in the instructor comments on the survey is that we are not doing enough to provide professional development workshops on the teaching of diversity. What more can we do, as a college, to ensure that we are helping instructors help students to meet this goal?
- While we have some data that indicate Norco College students are being asked in their classrooms to understand aspects of diversity, we have no compelling evidence that they have actually achieved what is increasingly being referred to as “intercultural competence,” the set of knowledge, skills, and attitudes “needed to interact successfully with others from different backgrounds.” (See <http://learningoutcomesassessment.org/NILOApieces.html>.) Do we believe that it is sufficient for student to understand and appreciate diversity, or do we want them—much more ambitiously—to be able to live effectively in an increasingly diverse world? It may be time to consider a global awareness / intercultural competence course requirement, as so many colleges and universities have already done. But that would involve a significant modification of the existing GE program—something we have been unable, as yet, to do.

## Appendix 1

### Student services activities related to global awareness, diversity, and self-development

Norco College is one of the first community colleges to offer the internationally acclaimed ATHENA Leadership Academy. The academy curriculum uses eight key principles of leadership to enhance, strengthen, and provide a foundation for students to become confident, aware, and engaged citizens, facilitating academic success, civic responsibility, and the opportunity for achieving career goals. This academy began in fall 2012 with 11 students successfully completing the program and receiving certification. The topics covered during this academy are

- Conflict resolution
- Ethical decision making
- Gender based approaches to leadership
- Leadership traits

Norco College promotes individual, intellectual, and personal development through participation in college wide committees (Legacy), involvement in campus wide initiatives (Recycling), transfer, health, and career fairs. Norco programs such as EOPS/CARE, Rites to Thrive, Puente, TRiO (SSS, Upward Bound), the Talented Tenth Program (T3P), and Norco Honors/Scholars further contribute to an enhanced learning environment. Staff members and student leaders involved in these programs strive to provide students with opportunities to explore their personal and professional potential outside the classroom, as well as to develop skills needed to succeed in the community and the workforce.

ASNC and Student Activities collaborate each year, offering fall and spring leadership workshops and summer leadership training retreats in which students acquire technical knowledge (e.g., Roberts Rules of Order and the ASNC Constitution and Bylaws) as well as study and discuss college wide concerns, from recycling to the cost of textbooks. A total of 20 student leaders participated. Of those who participated, 15 students showed increased understanding of activities procedures and policies (75% rate of proficiency). In 2012, 43 out of 50 total participants showed improved proficiency in recognizing commonly used terminology and procedures of Norco College shared governance (86% completion rate).

Topics include

- Effective communication skills
- Event planning
- Principles of leadership
- Region and state community college politics
- Shared governance
- Team work
- Time management

A variety of cultural and aesthetic activities, encouraging students to participate as part of their academic and personal development, include:

- Cinco De Mayo Celebrations
- Earth Day/Week
- Educational Forums and movie screenings
- Entertainment Events
- Gaming tournaments and expos
- Guest Speakers and performers
- Harvest Festival
- Hispanic Heritage Month, Women’s History Month, Asian Pacific Heritage Month, Black History Month events
- Lecture Series
- Music and Choir Performances
- Speech meets
- Veterans’ Day Celebrations

The Legacy Committee promotes college wide dialogue on diversity-related issues through guest speakers, lectures, and movie screenings on topics such as

- Disability Awareness
- Gender and Sexual Orientation
- Generational Differences
- Mental Health Awareness
- Religion and Spirituality

Likewise, the Norco College ALLY program, in partnership with GSA (Gender and Sexuality Awareness) club, fosters a safe community for gay, lesbian, and transgender students. An ALLY is a visible member of the Riverside Community College District community (staff, faculty or students) who is willing to provide a safe haven and an empathetic ear to anyone concerned with sexual orientation or gender identity issues. GSA sponsored a celebration for “National Coming Out Day.”

College wide diversity-related activities are primarily led by the Legacy diversity committee. This committee – composed of faculty, staff, administrators, and students – is responsible for organizing and facilitating campus events and activities that raise awareness of and promote respect for diversity among members of the College community (see *Legacy Committee, Webpage; Past Events*). For example the college hosted a Day of the Dead presentation and celebration to recognize a cultural tradition celebrated in Latin America and parts of the United States (see *Legacy Committee, Minutes, November 30, 2012*). Surveys are administered after every Legacy event to determine their effectiveness and provide input for future events. Legacy hosts diversity awareness activities throughout the academic year, and it provides the campus community with informative diversity-related facts via posters and electronic media during Diversity Awareness Month in April.

The College library's Read 2 Succeed @ Norco College book topics and art exhibits at the College Art Gallery also promote diversity awareness for the College community. The Read 2 Succeed program highlights literary works by various authors that address social and historical issues relevant to the College's diverse community (see Read 2 Succeed Flyers). The Art Gallery has also hosted a number of exhibits, including artwork by prominent Latino artists and female artists, to promote diversity among the campus and local communities.

## **Appendix 2**

### **Library-sponsored activities related to diversity, global awareness, and self development**

Two Norco College Library sponsored events directly address the RCCD General Education Program SLO for Self-Development and Global Awareness: Read 2 Succeed @ Norco College, and the Norco College Library Poetry Performance Event. Read 2 Succeed is held during fall and spring semesters and consists of a college wide read of a selected common book. Two book discussion events are held during the first two months of the semester in which students are given the opportunity to share their thoughts, ideas and/or comments about the book. The third event held during the final month of the term consists of the author of the book coming to speak on campus and enabling students to pose questions directly to him/her and/or meet the author personally. Books focus on engaging cultural and social viewpoints, and authors represent diverse ethnic, racial, and societal backgrounds. Students participating in this program are not only challenged to read more, and to critically evaluate what they read, they are also exposed to new opportunities to develop personally and as global citizens. The library sponsored Poetry Performance event is held once in each fall and spring semesters and involves giving students an artistically stimulating opportunity to express themselves by reading/performing an original poem they have composed, or by choosing to read/perform a classic, or other authored work. Students who participate in this event are exposed to a variety of diverse and cultural viewpoints, as well as various literary and creative treatments of ethics, citizenship, personal development and well-being. In addition, the library provides access to print and electronic resources and services that support and enhance the informational, cultural, global, diversity and personal awareness needs of students. As such, the library acts as a key agent of transformational power for the members of the academic community.

### Appendix 3

#### Faculty Responses to SurveyMonkey questions on the teaching of diversity, global awareness, and self development

##### Norco College General Education Survey on the Teaching of Diversity

Please cite some specific ways (or examples of how) you teach students to become more aware of diversity or various cultural viewpoints.

Number	Response Text
1	<p>I assign group work wherein the members are randomly assigned - they work together in collecting data for their group presentation.</p> <p>The Art 6 (Art Appreciation) course at Norco covers a wide spectrum of art from a wide range of cultures. I emphasize that art should be evaluated with an understanding of the culture that produced it.</p>
2	<p>I also teach material that involves cross cultural influences...it is often the nature of art.</p>
3	<p>In our reading and analysis, we look at diversity of voice and different literary theories that relate to diversity: feminisms, queer theory, non-western archetypes.</p>
4	<p>Just to give a general idea, our topics of argument include the death penalty in the U.S., drug prohibition, and the abortion controversy. By virtue of the topics themselves "diversity" issues naturally arise.</p>
5	<p>Within psychology, there can be a tendency for researchers to focus on their available population as subjects for their studies and I remind my students to be aware that the population used in research can affect its results. Many major studies from the past have not been replicated in other cultures (e.g., Asch's studies on conformity) and I point out that while it does not debunk the results, it does point out their limitations. I also emphasize those studies that specifically examine differences and commonalities between cultures in the realm of psychological functioning like research into the universally identifiable facial expressions that examined non-Western populations.</p>

Additionally, I point out the dominance of heteronormative thinking and make room in lecture and class discussion for the inclusion of same-sex orientations, transgender issues, and gender identity questions as they arise in relation to development, therapy, and sexual hardwiring.

Including examples in lecture of cultural diversity to enhance the understanding of the material.

**6** Reading passages in the textbook that use cultural diversity concepts.

Integrating cultural diverse information into lecture/power point slides.

Group projects involving student to brainstorm specific examples of the ways different cultures emphasize class concepts, including marriage, rites of passage, treatment of individuals in society.

Research projects involving finding studies that reflect cultural differences.

**7** Reading passages about cultural diversity in regard to specific concepts taught in class.

We examine theatre from many other cultures and perspectives (western and non-western). We look at the universality theatre inherently possesses and how the impulse is in every culture and society. We look at several examples of feminist plays and approaches. We explore the ideas of cross-gender casting and trans cultural approaches to performance in general. We explore the idea of experiencing theatre from the perspective

**8** of someone who is disabled or challenged in some way.



- 9 In my English 1A class, we spend a great deal of time discussing issues of racial equality due to our common essay focused on Martin Luther King Jr. Additionally I teach a unit on Rogerian argument, designed to show students how to consider various points of view on their topics, including sex and gender, politics, economics, and culture.
- 10 I include readings over the course that speak to race, gender, and class. These readings are discussed in class in terms of how a dominant culture can inevitably overrun others.
- 11 One example is taught in the motivation and emotion chapter. We discuss obesity and the bias society holds against those who are obese as well as cultural differences in this bias.
- 12 Reading, discussing, and writing about texts written by authors of multiple cultures and races. In addition, students apply learning, from the readings, to their own cultural, racial, and gender challenges

**13** Class discussion

**14** research methods, results of research, historic perspectives, bias in results

I teach about the history of the disability rights movement and legal issues, and teach about the importance of children being introduced to disability awareness from an early age. I use a film and film clips for this area.

I compare and contrast the way we in the US handle such issues as birthing and sex education, with other developed nations, including outcomes. Research, discussion, and films are used, with students responding to critical thinking-based questions in writing. When we talk about food we discuss poverty and food uncertainty here in this country, along with nutrition needs, and how this varies by region and income levels. Discussion questions, film clips, and readings contribute to this unit.

**15** LGBT issues are studied including history, marriage equality, bullying, definitions, etc. via film clips, research studies, discussion questions, activities to stimulate thoughtful consideration of thoughts and beliefs. Films and reflective writing are included as well.

**16** I teach about gender socialization by exposing students to research studies and through activities involving thinking critically about gender stereotypes and their consequences. In addition, I show documentaries which address such areas as violence and the socialization of males and issues related to the objectification of women in advertising. We study and discuss stereotypes and perception and apply that learning to issues of race, for example by becoming familiar with the work of scholars such as Tim Wise.

**17** I have students research the authors' background (life, culture, education, class, etc.) and examine how this influenced his/her literary works. The authors who are examined in this course cross gender and many cultural lines.

Music being a common denominator regardless of our different ethnic backgrounds, gender, sexuality, beliefs, or political views.

Music brings us together.

**18** The power of music!

Discuss gender & ethnic diversity within the profession of psychology.

19 Discuss diversity and cultural issue with regard to various aspects of psychology (e.g., perception and other mental processing capabilities, intelligence and culture fair testing, development, psychological disorders, diagnosis, and treatment.

20 I spend time discussing the historical and cultural contexts of pieces of literature; such discussions touch on a number issues related to race, gender, etc. These issues come up most often with discussion of Othello. The class sessions inevitably turn to issues of race, how Othello is seen by his contemporaries, and the ways the staging of the play has changed as a result of changes in societal views regarding race and women's rights. We discuss not only the viewpoints and biases of other times and contexts but biases current audiences may be bringing to their reactions to the play.

Assign readings and show video addressing feminist epistemology, feminist philosophy of science.

Assign readings and videos in which minority experts are represented.

Assign readings on issues of racism and sexism as part of an ethics unit.

21 Online discussion board assignment in which ideas from readings on racism and sexism are to be applied to elements of students experience and shared with others.

Examining texts from multiple perspectives based on factors like age, gender, personal beliefs, spirituality. EX: Looking at the misrepresentations of Frankenstein and then doing a close reading of the numerous interpretations of the novel itself based on one's background and prior knowledge.

Comparing the treatment of women and the changes/expectations of marriage by analyzing "The Story of an Hour" and "Trifles".

Discussing excerpts from Ralph Ellison's Invisible Man and the complications of socio-cultural abuse in light of one's race.

22 Discussing the film A Raisin in the Sun and the implications of targeted racial bias and class assumptions.

### Norco College General Education Survey on the Teaching of Diversity

The language of the GE learning outcome speaks of the need to foster "awareness" of diversity and various cultural viewpoints. In your teaching of this class, if you strive for something other than awareness (e.g., appreciation, understanding, etc.), what is it?

#### Number

1 an appreciation of the positive contributions that different ethnic groups have given to the betterment of American society.

2 I hope to make students more aware of their visual surroundings. This awareness is augmented if the student can

recognize cross cultural influences in our everyday surroundings as well as in the more formal museum or gallery setting. There are issues of individual expression and "mass" or group identity also to be considered.

3 I ask students to use an alternative theory in their writing at least one time.

4 As a theme, it just works out to grappling in these topics with the fact of unequal treatment under the law of nonwhites.

I encourage discussion of students' personal stories, within the bounds of good taste and reason, to illustrate to the class the diversity among them. Many students may never know the background and experiences of their fellow

5 students without hearing their firsthand accounts.

6 The appreciation of the value of cultural diversity.

7 I would say appreciation of the value of living in a diverse culture and recognizing the enriching value of this.

8 Definitely appreciation and understanding of different cultures and perspectives.

I strive to teach my students the ability to put themselves in the shoes of others, particularly with those they might disagree with.

9  
10 More than just awareness, I want my students to empathize and appreciate what diversity feels like and how it challenges us. Example - when teaching lifespan development (school years) we talk about learning disability. I present the slides backwards (mirror image) and challenge them to read it. I tell them this might be similar to the struggle a dyslexic student might feel reading normal slides.

11 I begin with awareness and work toward understanding and acceptance.

12 appreciation and ACCEPTANCE

13 Appreciation, understanding, respect are what I strive for.

14 I would say that I strive for understanding as well as acceptance, then beyond that, to respect.

15 For example, on the very first day of class I tell my students that we all come from different backgrounds, and those backgrounds influence our perspective; as such, each individual's background is unique, valid, and valuable to assist in

analysis.

16 Appreciation of music through the different eras in history, as well as understanding of how the socio-political background during past and present times influenced the arts. Thought provoking and encourage the use of critical thinking.

17 awareness, understanding

18 I strive for not only awareness or understanding but tolerance. I also emphasize the difference between tolerance and acceptance. That is, I emphasize repeatedly that one need not agree with another person's views to respect the person holding those views.

19 Understanding - but also recognition that one's own viewpoint is shaped by the majority culture (whatever ethnicity, race, sexual orientation, gender you are)

20 To appreciate the various interpretations of a text or issue. To get students to acknowledge other ways of seeing, thereby having them reexamine their own views and come to a better understanding as to why they think and believe something, and possibly challenge those stances.

## Norco College General Education Survey on the Teaching of Diversity

What do you think the college (or your discipline) could do to improve the teaching of diversity and various cultural viewpoints?

### Number

1 Have more Race and Ethnic Relations classes offered and provide students with appropriate college credits for enrolling in these classes.

2 Our art appreciation class is VERY European oriented...I know this is a trend that the authors of these texts are addressing but they continue to treat african Asian, Central and South American, Native American and Oceanic arts as "The Other" art (because of its less poignant impact on the more "dominant" Euro-centric art history...)

Offer more specialized courses/ European art history, African Art, Islamic Art, Gender specific art, Art and

(Dis)Ablity, etc.

- 3 I think we need some examples and/or modeling of ideas and how they might be incorporated into different disciplines. Some content areas do not lend themselves well to examine specifics of cultural viewpoints.
- 4 Helping to make faculty aware of a commitment to diversity is important. So often we teach how we were taught which perpetuates the same stereotypes and viewpoints.
- 5 Some instructors have guest speakers, perhaps we could make it known to other instructors who in the community is willing and able to make themselves available to appear before a class.
- 6 Offer workshops to teach faculty how to include these concepts in the classroom and how to integrate them into assignments.
- 7 Workshops offered to faculty to give strategies of including this in the classroom and assignments.
- 8 Explore more specific performance outlets that celebrate the idea of diversity and universality.
- 9 College and English should teach students HOW to think, not necessarily what to think. By this I mean we should focus on exposing them to different viewpoints and giving them tools to look beyond their own culture and experience, but not necessarily force feed them civics lessons. Critical thinking and education is the bane of hate and discrimination, regardless of whether we tell them what's right and what's wrong.
- 10 I think we need more diversity training and events.
- 11 HI: I think focus and awareness groups would be helpful.
- 12 ensure it is in the course SLOs
- 13 The college could bring in speakers, show films, have discussions, which would complement classroom experiences.
- 14 Bring speakers to campus, have programs which involve drama and storytelling, panel discussions, films and question and answer sessions, open to the whole college.

15 I feel the college is excelling in cultural awareness, tolerance, and appreciation.

16 As an example: offering MUS-89 (Multicultural Music in America) more often would be the ideal vehicle for not only teaching "music" but for exposing the students to cultural diversity and awareness, as well.

17 I think we could emphasize more clearly the reasons behind teaching diversity and various cultural viewpoints. Too often, students readily assert that diversity is important but are unable to explain why.

Yes:

First my discipline - philosophy is particularly insensitive to issues of diversity and our course outlines are very traditional. While I think that most faculty are more aware of the need to address issues of diversity in their classroom the discipline should do more to encourage this through revision of the CORs.

18 The college needs to have a more widespread discussion of how to address diversity in the classroom. It is very difficult for faculty trained during a period when the traditional curriculum in their discipline did not include non-white, non-males to learn how to effectively integrated material and discussion that is reflective of the diversity of our students effectively. I suspect we could learn from each other if we were to have a workshop in which we shared techniques for doing so as well as caveats about ways that were less successful.

19 Encourage lesser known works. For example, self-published works.

## Norco College General Education Survey for Self-Development

Please cite some examples of how you teach students to develop goals and/or devise strategies for personal development and well being.

### Number

1

Compare personal risk factors with current lifestyle to create measurable goals in improving



personal health and well being.

2 Creation of written time management skills which allows them to identify their weaknesses and strengths. This allows them to develop a clear understanding of where they require change in order to succeed as a student and with their life responsibilities.

3 Through the process of providing examples of phenomena which impact the student's health, discussing consequences, and exploring alternatives. This process is repeated across every health dimension during the course of the semester.

### Norco College General Education Survey for Self-Development

**What do you think the college (or perhaps your discipline) could do to improve its teaching of self development and well being skills?**

**Number**

1 Decrease class sizes.

2 It would benefit our colleagues and department to collaborate in regards to what strategies, teaching methods and resources have proven to be successful or helpful in conveying this important skill of self development and well being with our students.

3 Offer more sections of HES 1 so that the cap size could be reduced, potentially giving enrolled students more opportunities for personalized feedback and discussion during lectures.